



**REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA**  
**IPARD II Monitoring Committee**

***Draft Minutes of the second meeting of the IPARD Monitoring Committee***  
***2014-2020***

**Arch. No. - \_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_**

**Date: \_\_\_\_\_, 2018**

**Skopje**



## **I. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

**MSc. Nefrus Celiku, Chairman of the IPARD Monitoring Committee;**

**Biljana Kostovska, Head of Department for management of EU's pre-accession funds for rural development (IPARD).**

### **Members present at the IPARD Monitoring Committee:**

1. **Trajan Dimkovski**, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Economy;
2. **Nikica Bachovski**, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Economy;
3. **Slavica Mihajlovska Gosikj**, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Economy;
4. **Maja Lazareska Joveska**, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Economy;
5. **Vulnet Arifi**, Ministry of Local Self-Government;
6. **Ljiljana Vukovic**, Agency for Promotion of Entrepreneurship of the Republic of Macedonia;
7. **Petar Gjorgjiev**, Rural Development Network of the Republic of Macedonia;
8. **Ana Kotevska PhD**, Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Food;
9. **Saso Ristevski**, Macedonian Association of Processors;
10. **Marina Toshevska** - LAG AGRO LEADER;
11. **Gordana Lozanovska Stefanovska** - LAG Pelagonija;
12. **Sasho Krcoski** - Network of Young Farmers;
13. **Evgenia Serafimovska Kirkovski-SEP**;
14. **Aleksandra Matic Sever** - Ministry of Culture;

### **Present deputy members of the IPARD Monitoring Committee:**

1. **Vancho Novoselski**, Agency for Food and Veterinary;
2. **Aleksandra Todorovska**, Macedonian Ecological Society;
3. **Elena Gunova**, Chamber of Crafts Skopje;
4. **Vlatko Ilievski** - Faculty of Veterinary Medicine.
5. **Aleksandar Zarkov**, Union of Chambers of Commerce of the Republic of Macedonia
6. **Anton Fajdiga**, Ministry of Transport and Communications;
7. **Ljupco Mihajlov**, Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Food - UGD Shtip
8. **Petar Andonov**, Agency for Promotion of Agricultural Development;



9. **Natasha Vrteska**, Community of the Units of Local Self-Government;

**Representatives of the European Commission (EC) in an advisory role:**

1. **Liam Breslin**, Directorate for Agriculture and Rural Development (DG-Agri);
2. **Anna Nowak**, Directorate for Agriculture and Rural Development (DG-Agri);
3. **Zigo Rutkovskis**, Directorate for Agriculture and Rural Development (DG-Agri).

**Representatives of the European Delegation**

1. **Nicola Bertolini**, Delegation of European Union in the Republic of Macedonia;
2. **Margarita Deleva**, Delegation of European Union in the Republic of Macedonia;
3. **Katerina Kus- Ivanova Filkova**, Delegation of European Union in the Republic of Macedonia.

**Representatives of IPARD structure:**

**Representatives from NAO and NF:**

1. **Tanja Zezova**, National Fund, Ministry of Finance.

**Representatives of the IPARD Managing Authority (MA):**

1. **Biljana Kostovska**, Head of IPARD Department;
2. **Viktor Mladenovski**, Unit for implementation of Technical Assistance of IPARD funds;
3. **Vasilka Tamburkova**, Unit for monitoring of the implementation of IPARD funds and reporting;
4. **Isa Imishti**, Unit for monitoring of the implementation of IPARD funds and reporting;
5. **Oliver Stefanovski**, Unit for Technical Assistance of IPARD funds;
6. **Jasmina Hadzhibulic**, Unit for monitoring of the implementation of IPARD funds and reporting;
7. **Zlatko Kolevski**, Unit for Technical Assistance of IPARD funds;
8. **Kiril Ristovski**, Unit for Technical Assistance of IPARD funds;
9. **Sadzide Demiri**, Unit for coordination of preparatory activities for agri-environmental measures and “LEADER” under IPARD funds;



10. **Dusko Jakimovski**, Unit for programming and evaluation of IPARD funds;
11. **Muhadin Limani**, Unit for programming and evaluation of IPARD funds;
12. **Gordana Smileska**, Unit for monitoring of the implementation of IPARD funds and reporting;
13. **Gabriela Petrova**, Unit for Technical Assistance of IPARD funds.
14. **Dusko Jakimovski**, Unit for programming and evaluation of IPARD funds;

**Representatives from the Agency for Financial Support to Agriculture and Rural Development (AFSARD):**

1. **Nikolce Babovski**, Director of the Agency for Financial Support in Agriculture and Rural Development (AFSARD);
2. **Maja Brajovic**, Head of Internal Audit, Agency for Financial Support in Agriculture and Rural Development (AFSARD);
3. **Vladimir Hristov**- IPARD PA;
4. **Vangel Nanevski**- IPARD PA;
5. **Panche Arsov**- IPARD PA.

*Results: The Chairperson of the Committee, 14 members and 9 deputy members with voting right (out of a total of 29 members with a right to vote) participated in the meeting. A quorum of 2/3 of the members with a right to vote (or their replacements) was achieved to hold the meeting in accordance with the Rules of Procedure Article 8 paragraph 3.*

**The Checklist for presence of members from the meetings of the IPARD Monitoring Committee is shown in Appendix 1 of this minutes.**

**The List of observers is shown in Appendix 2 of this minutes.**

## II. AGENDA



### III. RESULTS OF THE IPARD II MONITORING COMMITTEE MEETING:

#### **1. In reference to point 1 of the agenda: "Adoption of the draft Agenda for the second meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee".**

The meeting was opened by the State Secretary, Mr. Nefrus Celiku - Chairperson of the Committee, welcoming everyone present at the meeting. The Chairperson of the Committee informed the members of the draft agenda for the second meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee and proposed adding a new point in the agenda, i.e. sub-point 8.4: "Progress Report on the Implementation of the Plan of activities for Visibility and Communication of IPARD 2014-2020".

Taking into account that the members of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee had no objections regarding the agenda, the following decision was adopted:

**Decision No.1: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee adopted the Agenda for the (2<sup>nd</sup>) second (autumn) meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee.**

#### **2. In reference to point 2 of the Agenda: "Adoption of the amendments to the Rules of Procedures of the Monitoring Committee of the IPARD II Programme of the Republic of Macedonia"**

Chairperson of the Committee informed the members regarding the amendments to the Rules of Procedure of the Monitoring Committee of the IPARD II Programme of the Republic of Macedonia. The representatives from EC noted that they have additional comments on the submitted Rules of Procedures that will be submitted to the IPARD MC Secretariat and will be adopted by the members under written procedure. Taking into account that the supportive materials for the meeting were submitted to the members with a delay, i.e. on December 6, 2017 (they have to be submitted 15 working days before the meeting), the representatives of the EC proposed, the other documents, instead on the meeting, to be adopted by written procedure.

#### **3. In reference to point 3 of the agenda: "Adoption of the Minutes from the previous (first) meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee held on 17<sup>th</sup> of February 2017"**



Chairperson of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee, informed that the minutes from the previous 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee held on 17<sup>th</sup> of February 2017 was sent to the members of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee on 5<sup>th</sup> of April 2016. Until 19<sup>th</sup> of April 2016, the Secretariat of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee 2014-2020 didn't receive any comments by the members of the Monitoring Committee of IPARD 2014-2020.

The members of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee had no objections regarding the minutes so the following decision was adopted:

**Decision No.3: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee adopted the Minutes from the (1<sup>st</sup>) first meeting as final, held on 17<sup>th</sup> of February 2017**

**4. In reference to point 4 of the agenda: "Information regarding the change of the members of the Monitoring Committee of the IPARD Programme 2014-2020"**

Head of IPARD MA, informed about the new members of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee, who are representatives of: Ministry of Agriculture, Agro-Leader, LAG Pelagonija, Syndicate of Agricultural Producers "SPAS" and the Network of Young Farmers.

The representative from EC, Ana Novak, proposed that the Rules of Procedure should not be amended every time due to every change of members, but the list of members of the Monitoring Committee with the their names, surnames, functions and institutions they represent, should be added as an Annex.

Regarding this point, the following conclusion was adopted:

**Conclusion No.1: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed about the change of the members of the Monitoring Committee of the IPARD Programme 2014-2020.**



**5. In reference to point 5 of the Agenda: “Information for implementation of decisions/conclusions adopted at the previous (1<sup>st</sup>) meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee”**

Ms. Kostovska, reported on the progress of implementation of the Decisions/Conclusion adopted on the previous 1<sup>st</sup> IPARD II Monitoring Committee meeting. She also added that the two decisions adopted at the first meeting of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee, i.e. the Evaluation Plan 2014-2020 and the Activities Plan for Visibility and Communication for the IPARD Programme 2014-2020 were adopted by a written procedure in March 2017.

Having no further comments, the following conclusion was adopted:

**Conclusion No.2: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed on the progress made in implementation of the decisions/conclusions from the 1<sup>st</sup> IPARD MC, held on 17<sup>th</sup> of February, 2017.**

**6. In reference to point 6 of the Agenda: “Information of the IPA Monitoring Committee”**

Ms. Evgenija Serafimovska Kirkovska informed about the IPA Monitoring Committee held in March 2017, informing the new members of the Committee on the work and competencies of the IPA Monitoring Committee. Also, Ms. Kirkovska gave a cross-section of the rules for sectoral approach in IPA II indicating that the use of funds will largely depend on the establishment of the sectoral approach, i.e. the fulfilment of 5 criteria:

- *Sector strategy*
- *Institutional capacity*
- *Sector coordination*
- *A performance assessment framework*
- *Year-round budgeting*

The Commission will monitor the progress of the country in establishing a sectoral approach on an annual basis, and its assessment will affect the amount of funds which on an annual basis will be allocated for the financial needs in the sectors.



The indicative strategic document 2014-2020 is in phase of changing within the services of the European Union and the final available funds for the Republic of Macedonia for the entire perspective will be known by June 2018.

The EC representative asked for an explanation regarding the latest employment. The Director of AFSARD explained that through Information to the Government of the Republic of Macedonia, it was requested to increase the number of new 68 employees with a proposal for their phased employment.

Having no further comments, the IPARD MC adopted the following decision:

**Conclusion No. 3: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed about the IPA Monitoring Committee held in March 2017.**

## **7. In reference to point 7 of the Agenda: „ State of play of implementation of the IPARD Programme 2014-2020"**

### **7.1. Information on the received applications from 1<sup>st</sup> call under IPARD 2014-2020**

Mr. Nikolce Babovski informed the members regarding the received requests on the first IPARD 2014-2020 Public Call, which lasted until 21.07.2017, i.e. 1648 requests for the three published measures were received. In Measure 1, contracts are expected to be signed in March 2018.

He also emphasized the need for new employments and promotions in AFSARD according to their needs.

Regarding the question from EC representative Liam Breslin how many applications per week are processed within the agency, Mr. Babovski answered that only one application is being processed weekly.

Considering that this number is too small, i.e. about 20 applications have to be processed weekly, the EC representative Liam Breslin expressed great concern and stressed the urgent need for new employments and capacity building in AFSARD. This dynamic of





processing the applications is worrying and endangering the use of IPARD funds, and if it continues, we will face a decommitment of funds in 2018.

IPARD MC adopted the following conclusion:

**Conclusion No. 4: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed about the received applications on the 1<sup>st</sup> call under IPARD 2014-2020**

**7.2. In reference to point 7.2 of the Agenda: „ Information on the status with the entrustment of budget implementation tasks for Measure Rural Infrastructure "**

The representative from NAO informed regarding the status with the entrustment of budget implementation tasks for Measure Rural Infrastructure.

During 2015/2016 preparatory activities for accreditation of the measure rural infrastructure started. The accreditation (entrustment) package for the measure Rural public infrastructure from the IPARD II Programme (2014-2020) was prepared and submitted for external assessment to Audit Authority for IPA on 10th of January 2017 with aim to gain independent audit opinion (procedure established in the Framework Agreement). The foreseen dynamics for entrustment submission for this measure is middle of 2018 since the findings such as adoption of the Law on Agency and Decree for implementation of IRI measure and employment of new staff are processes that are time demanding.

Regarding this point, the representative from ZELS, Ms. Natasha Vrteska, pointed out that ZELS, as an association of municipalities, during the discussion with AFSARD, highlighted the biggest problems of the municipalities: their urban plans. Their insistence with the National Program and with some other programs, with the MoLSP certain funds to be covered/allocated, so that municipalities can apply for drafting projects for these planning documents.

The Head of the IPARD Managing Authority, Biljana Kostovska, added that this measure will contribute to the development of the municipalities. Pre-financing is something that needs to be resolved on a higher level together with the MoF and MAFWE. Much of the



obstacles, the problems of the municipalities, are not within the competence of the ministry. They should be solved by the municipalities themselves.

Regarding the information sessions that will be done with the municipalities, the ZELS representative requested to be included not only in the overall process, but also in the individual activities organized by MA. If there are remarks or suggestions, they should be implemented by ZELS.

Based on this item IPARD Monitoring Committee adopted the following conclusion:

**Conclusion No.5: Managing Authority to conduct an analysis of the municipalities, i.e. how many of them can apply for the Rural Infrastructure measure and submit it to the EC and the members of the IPARD II Monitoring Committee at the latest June 2018**

The representative of the APRZ- Petar Andonov, stressed that more institutions and relevant factors should be involved in order to find a common solution.

The following conclusion adopted:

**Conclusion No. 6: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed about the status with the entrustment of budget implementation tasks for Measure Rural Infrastructure**

### **7.3 In reference to point 7.3 of the Agenda: „Introduction of new measures in IPARD 2014-2020/ Discussion on first modification of IPARD programme"**

Regarding this point, the Head of MA Ms. Biljana Kostovska gave a brief description of the first change of the IPARD 2014-2020 Programme. She added that it is planned to introduce new measures called soft measures and one of the measures that is planned to be included is LEADER. IPARD 2014-2020 is a very open programme, covering all sectors and for the first time industrial crops and cereal crops are included. On the first public call, almost all funds from the program were requested.



HoMA asked MC members to be actively involved in the process of the first IPARD modification 2014-2020 with concrete proposals for improving the program document.

She informed about the Guarantee Fund, established in cooperation with USAID and implemented through three commercial banks and two savings houses.

IPARD Monitoring Committee adopted the following conclusion:

**Conclusion No. 7: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed about new measures in IPARD 2014-2020 and first modification of IPARD 2014-2020 Programme**

## **8. In relation to item 8 of the Agenda: "Technical Assistance Measure Activities"**

### **8.1. of the Agenda: „Information on the progress regarding implementation of the APTA"**

The representative of IPARD Managing Authority Kiril Ristovski informed the IPARD II Monitoring Committee on the type of activities implemented in accordance with Technical Assistance Action Plan for 2017. He emphasized that 2 contracts were signed, i.e. 2 procurements, and 2 procurements are in procedure, since their realization continues in 2018 in accordance with APTA 2017,.

EC representative Liam Breslin stressed that the Technical Assistance Measure is a strong tool that needs to be used to the maximum.

Following conclusion was adopted:

**Conclusion No. 8: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed on the progress regarding implementation of APTA 2017"**

### **8.2. of the Agenda: „ Adoption of APTA 2018"**

EC Representatives noted that they have comments on the APTA and will be additionally submitted and considered together with the MA. The members of the IPARD Monitoring Committee had no remarks regarding the APTA for 2018, but it will be resubmitted for



adoption to members by written procedure once it has been agreed with the EC. The aligned APTA will be adopted by a written procedure and the following decision will be brought:

**Decision no.3: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee adopted APTA for 2018 as final**

**8.3. of the Agenda: „Adoption of Action plan for publicity and communication for 2018 IPARD Programme 2014-2020"**

The representative from MA, Ms. Sonja Trajkova, presented the Action Plan for Communication and Publicity for 2018 for IPARD 2014-2020. It will be adopted with a written procedure and the following decision will be brought:

**Decision no.4: IPARD II Monitoring Committee adopted the Action plan for publicity and communication for 2018 IPARD Programme 2014-2020**

**8.4. of the Agenda: „ Progress Report on the Implementation of the Activities Plan on Visibility and Communication for IPARD 2014-2020"**

Regarding this point, the MA representative , Ms. Sonja Trajkova, presented the implemented activities of the Plan of activities for visibility and communication for IPARD 2014-2020 for the period 2016 and 2017, i.e. the following activities were realized:

1. Update of website [www.ipard.gov.mk](http://www.ipard.gov.mk) ;
2. IPARD info events;
3. Trainings, workshops and seminars
4. Appearances on national and local radio and television stations as newspapers and Internet portals;
5. Publications of leaflets, brochure, supplements.

Institutions responsible for the implementation of the abovementioned activities, respectively to competences and functions they perform, were: the Managing Authority (MA) within Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Economy and the Agency for Financial Support of Agriculture and Rural Development (AFSARD).

Having no further comments, the following decision was adopted:



**Conclusion No. 9: The IPARD II Monitoring Committee was informed on the Progress Report on the Implementation of the Activities Plan on the Visibility and Communication of IPARD 2014-2020**

**9. In relation to item 9 of the Agenda: „Information on functioning of the IPARD management and control system of IPARD"**

The representative of the National Fund, Ms. Tanja Zhezhova informed the IPARD MC about the activities that the NF conducted in the past period.

According to the Annual Verification Visit Plan for 2017 initially a verification visit was foreseen for the end of 2017 over the contracting phase under IPARD 2 programming period. Since the contracting phase under the first call under IPARD 2 is still in ongoing phase and the first contracts is expected to be signed at the beginning of 2018 (1<sup>st</sup> quarter) it was decided this verification visit to be conducted after the contracting phase is finished. Since the Financial Agreement for IPARD 2014-2020 entered into force on 29<sup>th</sup> of June 2017, as no contract is signed in the Programme, no audit report is issued regarding the programme. The system audit and audit of operations of the Audit Authority is ongoing.

In absence of comments, the IPARD MC members adopted the following conclusion:

**Conclusion No.10: IPARD Monitoring Committee was informed about functioning of the IPARD management and control system of IPARD**

**10. In reference to point 10 of the Agenda: „ Information/discussion about activities to be undertaken for ongoing evaluation of the IPARD Programme 2014-2020"**

Mr. Igor Troshanski informed about the planned activities for the ongoing Evaluation of IPARD 2014-2020.

He also stressed the need for employment of middle management in MA.

The following conclusion was adopted:



**Conclusion no.11: IPARD Monitoring Committee was informed about ongoing evaluation of the IPARD Programme 2014- 2020**

**11. In relation to item 11 of the Agenda: „AOB"**

EC representative Zigo Rutkovskis once again stressed that as long as one application is processed weekly in AFSARD, the IPARD in the Republic of Macedonia will be a problem. Therefore, it is necessary to take all measures to strengthen the human capacities in the IPARD Agency as soon as possible.

**12. In relation to item 12 of the Agenda: "Proposals for the Agenda of the next (3<sup>rd</sup>) IPARD MC meeting / agreement on indicative new date."**

Regarding point 12 of the agenda, the Chairperson informed about the draft agenda for the next meeting of IPARD 2014-2020 MC. The Chairperson proposed the next third meeting of the Committee to be agreed in accordance with the possibilities of the representatives of the European Commission.

No additional comments were given. Therefore the Chairperson concluded the 2<sup>nd</sup> Meeting of the IPARD Monitoring Committee to be closed.

FOR THE IPARD MONITORING COMMITTEE:	FOR THE SECRETARIATE:
Nefrus Cheliku MSc	Zhivko Brajkovski
Title: Chairperson	Head of IPARD Managing Authority
Signature:	Signature:
Date:	Date:





no.	Title and name of member	Institution	Present "√"	Absent "√"	Representative "√"	Replacement	Number of absences
1.	Nefrus Cheliku MSc	MAFWE	√				
<b>Government Institutions</b>							
2.	Trajan Dimkovski	MAFWE	√				0
3.	Nikica Bachovski	MAFWE	√				
4.	Maja Lazareska Joveska	MAFWE	√				0
5.	Slavica Mihajlovska Goshikj	MAFWE	√				
6.	Evgenija Serafimovska Kirkovski	SEA	√				0
7.	Bekim Hadziu	Ministry of economy		√			1
8.	Vulnet Arifi	Ministry of local self- government	√				0





9.	Aleksandra Matik Sever	Ministry of culture	√				0
10.	Nazmije Idrizi	Ministry of environment and local self-planning		√			1
11.	Darko Peshevski	Ministry of Transport and Communications			√	Anton Fajdiga	0
12.	Dushan Tomshikj	Ministry of labor and social policy		√			1
13.	Sashko Arsov	Agency for food and veterinary			√	Vancho Novoselski	0
AGENCIES							
14.	/	NEA			√	Petar Andonov	0
15.	Ljiljana Vukovikj	Agency for support of entrepreneurship	√				0
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL PARTNERS							
16.	Vasko Ristovski	Macedonian Chamber of commerce		√			2



17.	Ognen Orovchanec	Agrobiz chamber at the Association of Chambers of commerce of RM			√	Aleksandar Zarkov	0
18.	Sasho Risteski	Macedonian association of processors	√				0
19.	Veljo Tantarov	Association of farmers		√			2
20.	/	Association of local self-government units			√	Natasha Vrteska	0
21.	Ana Kotevska	Faculty of agricultural sciences and food	√				0
22.	Dragan Dojchinovski	Chamber of craftsmen			√	Elena Gunova	0
23.	Verica Ilieva	Faculty of agricultural sciences and food – UGD Stip			√	Ljupco Mihajlov	0
24.	Marina Toshevska	Agro- LIDER	√				0
25.	Petar Gjorgjiev	Rural network of RM	√				0
26.	Vladimir Petkov	Faculty for Veterinary Medicine			√	Vlatko Ilievski	0
27.	Sasho Krcoski	Network of Young farmers	√				0



28.	Gordana Lozanovska Stefanovska	LAG Pelagonija	√				
29.	Sasho Ristovski	Trade Union of Agricultural Producers "SPAS"		√			1
30.	Robertina Brajanoska	Macedonian ecological group			√	Aleksandra Todoroska	0
	<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>14</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>9</b>		





**Appendix 2: Checklist for presence of observers from IPARD Monitoring Committee**

**Representatives from government institutions:**

Jeton Zuka- MAFWE

**Representatives of the Audit Authority:**

Adem Curi- Director of Audit Authority;

Biljana Ivanovska- Sector for audit for component V – SAO;

Mimoza Shishkovska- Sector for audit for component V – SAO;

Sonja Panovski- Sector for audit for component V – SAO.

**Representatives of ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL PARTNERS**

Rodne Nastova- Institute for Livestock;

Nikola Pacinovski- Institute for Livestock;

Natasha Daniloska- Economic Institute;

Tatjana Petkovska Mirchevska- Economic Institute;

Zoran Janevski- Economic Institute;

Nikola Klopceviski- Fund for Innovation and Technological Development.